

**GOVERNANCE EDUCATION NETWORK (GEN)
FOR PROMOTING GOVERNANCE EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF BASELINE RESEARCH STUDIES-2009

BACKGROUND

Governance and democracy programs initiated by many aid agencies have established international recognition of Governance as a critical factor in the development process of transitional states. In Pakistan, many of the governance practitioners – including elected officials, civil servants, members of political parties, civil society leaders, corporate stakeholders, and actors within the national media and academia – need to enhance basic knowledge and skills on how nations are governed or transformed. The existing courses and trainings offered by government academies and some private institutions are not at par with the present day requirements and fundamentally lack meaningful research. All this has led to a dire need for the introduction of a properly designed governance curriculum that can initiate the process of formalized informed good governance.

Governance Institute Network International (GINI) with the assistance of Government of Norway and in partnership with the Norwegian Institute for Urban and Regional Research (NIBR), Oslo has launched an initiative to promote governance education in Pakistan. GINI program on governance education aims at developing a national integrated network by bringing together learning and research institutions from both the private and government sector in an effort to create a sustained basis for Pakistan to systematically approach the furtherance of governance knowledge. The objective of the program is to create governance capacity in various spheres of governance covering universities, institutions, practitioners, researchers, NGOs, think tanks and the student body of Pakistan which elects to take up governance courses. In a short period of a few months of launching of the program, the Governance Education Network has grown to 21 members including some of the most prestigious universities/colleges in the public and private sector which are actively collaborating in achieving the goals/objectives of the program:

The governance education program is structured on five components of *governance curriculum, training needs assessment, executive education, research and annual conference*. The Program Steering Committee and a sub-committee for each of these components comprising members of the network have been constituted for smooth implementation of various program components.

Conduct of Baseline Research Related to Governance Education

As collectively decided by all members of GEN during Network Activating Workshop held in May, this year, 2009 was declared as the year of baseline research aimed at providing sound footings for smooth execution of various program components. Despite primary commitments of members, it was highly appreciable that the Program Sub-committees held number of meetings during June-July, 2009 and finalized the proposals related to baseline research on Governance Curriculums, TNA, Executive Education and governance indicators. This enabled GINI Secretariat to formalize agreements with the concerned organizations/researchers in July, 2009 providing a clear framework for effective conduct of research including appointment of a national supervisor and a Norwegian Focal Person for each research study. In addition to the approved costs, contribution in kind of the participating institutions and individual of the network for each research study was assessed at Rs.600, 000 on account of cooperation and time devoted, use of office facilities, equipment, library etc in completing the baseline research.

Based of the assigned TOR, the research teams developed detailed inception reports which were finalized with input of designated NIBR Focal Person and concerned program sub-committee at the design stage during early August, 2009. The first draft research reports of six studies related to governance programs, TNA and executive education were submitted by the research teams in October, 2009 which were shared with the designated NIBR Focal Person for views and were reviewed by the concerned sub-committee in end October. Necessary guidelines were issued to the research teams for finalization of their reports in the light of NIBR input and review by the program sub-committees. The final draft reports were received from the research teams in November, 2009 which were finalized with NIBR input and based on the second review by the concerned sub-committee held in end November. These research reports were published for distribution to all stakeholders during the Pakistan-Norway Forum/Governance Education Network First International Conference on Governance, Sustainable Growth, Peace and Equity held at Islamabad from 13-15 December 2009. All the above research work was only possible in the limited available time with the concerted efforts of the research teams, members of program sub-committees and NIBR.

Research Findings & Recommendations

Main findings and recommendations of the six baseline research studies are as follows:

- i. Baseline Research on Governance Related Programs & Disciplines by Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab, Lahore- **Annex-I**
- ii. Baseline Research on TNA of Masters' level programs and courses by Centre for Public Policy and Governance (CPPG), FC College University, Lahore- **Annex-II**
- iii. Baseline Research on TNA of Bachelors' level programs by Institute of Public Policy (IPP), Beaconhouse National University, Lahore- **Annex-III**
- iv. Baseline Research on TNA of Public Colleges by Department of Public Administration, University of Karachi- **Annex-IV**
- v. Baseline Research on user needs profile of executive education on governance in Pakistan by Innovative Development Strategies (IDS), Islamabad- **Annex-V**
- vi. Baseline Research on Current state of executive education courses and programs in Pakistan by Dr. Pervez Tahir- **Annex-VI**

Detailed reports of above studies were distributed to all delegates of Pakistan-Norway Forum /Gen First International Conference on Governance, Sustainable Growth, Peace and Equity held at Islamabad, from 13-15 December 2009. These are also available at GINI website: http://www.giniweb.net/ver1/genweb/research_updates.html

**BASELINE RESEARCH ON
GOVERNANCE RELATED PROGRAMS OFFERED IN PAKISTAN
BY INSTITUTE OF ADMINISTRATIVE SCIENCES (IAS),
UNIVERSITY OF THE PUNJAB, LAHORE**

Key Findings:

- i. Pakistan's experience of running Public Administration and Public Policy programs clearly suggests that new academic programs exclusively dedicated to and with the nomenclature of Governance (such as BS(Hons)/MS Governance) may not be a viable option at present. A cautious approach and strategy needs to be adopted such as strengthening of existing MPA and MPP programs through faculty and curriculum development as well as preparation of local reading materials and introduction of PhD as well as MS in Governance in selected universities. [Based on analysis of consultants].
- ii. Governance courses, based on indigenous research, should be introduced in the curricula of Governance related programs as well as Social Science disciplines in the long run. [Based on analysis of consultants].
- iii. Social Science faculty should be inducted into Public Administration and Public Policy programs. Graduates of the same departments serving as faculty do not have sufficient exposure to Public Administration issues. [Derived from assessments of consultants as well as interviews with faculty members and focus group discussions with students].
- i. Upgraded MPA, Masters of Public Policy as well as four year BS programs offer the opportunity of introducing Governance and Public Administration courses. [Derived from assessments of the consultants].
- ii. A unique identity, distinctly separate from Business Administration programs, needs to be created and marketed for Public Administration, Public Policy and Governance programs. [Faculty interviews, student questionnaires and focus group discussions].
- iii. External and internal branding and marketing is required so that programs can be strengthened and appropriate human, financial and physical resources can be allocated to them. This will also help attract high performance students to these programs since they will perceive a securer employment future to be gained. [Assessment of consultants based on faculty interviews and student focus group discussions].
- iv. Institutions should engage in career planning and counseling research, workshops, marketing and networking for the benefit of students as well as programs. [A need has been highlighted by students as well as faculty respondents who stress that programs can have more clearly defined career paths].
- v. Some institutions offering Public Administration, Public Policy and Governance programs need to be more selective in terms of student intake. They should not just absorb the students rejected from business programs but should work to attract the best students. [In some institutions faculty and students admit that Public Administration programs attract those students who have been unable to secure admission into the more competitive and job market oriented Business Administration programs].
- vi. Faculty needs to be recruited and developed in the areas of Public Administration, Public Policy and Governance. Appropriate financial incentives for recruitment are required which should be competitive with other professions, especially with those of private sector professional employment opportunities. Cost of living should be factored in to be able to attract intelligent, motivated individuals especially males towards the teaching profession. [This represents the assessment of consultants based on the needs demonstrated in a number of institutions for better qualified and research motivated faculty].
- vii. Monetary and other incentives are required for indigenous research. Faculty should be provided substantial monetary incentives, research grants, lightened workload, research

- staff as well as physical facilities to encourage research. [This represents the assessment of consultants based on faculty interviews].
- viii. Teaching performance should have a positive or negative impact on performance based remuneration packages offered to faculty members. These must take into account students', the respective institution's as well as employers' perspectives. [This represents the assessment of consultants based on faculty interviews and student focus groups].
 - ix. Faculty members need to be encouraged to develop local publications so that students can learn about the Pakistani environment. Books, research journals, case studies, projects, presentations by guest speakers and field trips to public sector organizations are needed for practical learning. [The need for Pakistan based learning and research has been highlighted in all student focus groups].
 - x. Curricula in the areas of Public Administration, Public Policy and Governance need to be revised frequently so that they reflect the needs of Pakistan. [The need for Pakistan based learning and research has been highlighted in all student focus groups].
 - xi. Networking between institutions offering programs in Governance related areas is urgently needed so that resource and knowledge sharing is made possible. Students should have the option of taking courses at other universities. [This has been identified as a potential area for improvement by both faculty respondents as well as students taking part in focus groups].
 - xii. Given the state of pessimism that surrounds Pakistani public administration, public policies and governance practices it is critical that positive role models be identified and case studies be developed that highlight success stories in these areas so that the zeal students demonstrate for making a difference for their country can be encouraged. [Students taking part in focus group discussions failed to convincingly identify role models for themselves in the areas of Public Administration, Public Policy or Governance].
 - xiii. Visiting faculty should be integrated into the teaching profession by offering them training and development opportunities so that they can learn to effectively convey their practical knowledge to students. [The desire and need for real world practical learning was identified by a majority of students taking part in questionnaires and focus group discussions. Students expressed the view that visiting faculty with practical work experience should be used after giving them training on how best to convey their practical knowledge].
 - xiv. Educational institutions need to work on better internal management practices to reduce inefficiencies, develop and promote common visions and to do away with disruptive politics, within the faculty, which hinder their output. [Derived from assessments of consultants as well interviews with faculty and opinions expressed by students in focus groups].
 - xv. National vision statements need to be developed for curricula in the areas of Public Administration, Public Policy and Governance. These should be honored by all institutions offering programs and courses in the areas. [Derived from assessments of consultants as well interviews with faculty members].
 - xvi. Annual conferences, national seminars and curricula debates are needed as means of encouraging communication, cooperation and improvements in offerings. [Derived from assessments of consultants as well interviews with faculty and opinions expressed by students in focus groups].
 - xvii. Teaching methodologies and course outlines used by instructors are at times left to them on an individual basis. These need to be centrally monitored by institutions. Interactive, experiential learning needs to be encouraged. [Derived from assessments of consultants, questionnaires filled by students as well as from focus groups].
 - xviii. All institutions offering Public Administration, Public Policy and Governance programs should be required to have an Advisory Board constituting external experts from key public sector institutions. These Boards should convene regularly so that curricula and

- program offerings can be kept in line with market needs. [Derived from assessments of consultants as well interviews with faculty members].
- xix. Regulation and service delivery aspects of governance which are the core activities of government, inter-governmental relations, sectoral management (education, industry, agriculture, and infrastructure), and new tools of governance, contract management and administrative and public management reforms need to be included in courses. [Derived from assessments of consultants as well interviews with faculty members].
- xx. Physical facilities and environment offered to students reflect the importance given to the programs. In many institutions these physical facilities were either limited in space or lagging in maintenance. This sends out a wrong message to students, faculty and staff adversely impacting their perceived self-worth and motivations. Thus institutional resources should be spent to provide modern, neat and well maintained physical environments. [Derived from assessments of consultants, interviews with faculty members, questionnaires filled by students as well as from focus groups].
- xxi. Public Policy programs should be targeted towards mid-career experienced professionals, while Public Administration programs should be marketed to fresh graduates. [Derived from assessments of consultants, interviews with faculty members, questionnaires filled by students as well as from focus groups].
- xxii. Internships must be made mandatory in all Public Administration, Public Policy and Governance programs. [Derived from assessments of consultants, interviews with faculty members, questionnaires filled by students as well as from focus groups].
- xxiii. Institutions offering programs or courses in Public Administration, Public Policy and Governance must work with government ministries to acquire, share and analyze provincial as well as national policies. [Derived from assessments of consultants, interviews with faculty members, questionnaires filled by students as well as from focus groups].
- xxiv. An interdisciplinary approach, which is a prerequisite for addressing Governance issues, needs to be incorporated in the curriculum of academic disciplines. [Derived from assessments of consultants, interviews with faculty members, questionnaires filled by students as well as from focus groups].

Recommendations for Governance Education

- i. Pakistan's experience of running Public Administration and Public Policy programs clearly suggests that new dedicated governance programs with nomenclature such as BS(Hons)/MS in Governance may not be viable at present. Instead, there is a need for strengthening existing programs in Public Administration, Public Management, and Public Policy through development of Governance curriculum, development of indigenous reading material, and capacity building of faculty.
- ii. Post-graduate Diploma and certificate in Governance may be a viable option for launching dedicated program in Governance Studies. The Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab, has shown willingness to start such courses subject to the availability funds for initial years.
- iii. Multidisciplinary approach is recommended for curriculum development with courses in the area of regulatory governance, service delivery, institutional and public management reform, public policy analysis, development governance and management, collaborative governance mechanisms. There is a need to develop courses with special focus on policy and management issues in various sectors of Pakistan's economy.
- iv. Networking between institutions both on supply and demand side is strongly recommended for sustainability of Governance programs. Both GINI and GEN were long awaited initiatives that need to be strengthened.

**BASELINE RESEARCH ON TRAINING NEEDS ASSESSMENT (TNA)
FOR MASTER'S LEVEL PROGRAMS
BY CENTRE FOR PUBLIC POLICY & GOVERNANCE (CPPG),
F.C. COLLEGE (A CHARTERED UNIVERSITY), LAHORE:**

Findings

- i. In world class programs, there is less difference between policy programs (PA, PP) than between same programs of different universities. Specialization is thus dependent on the university than the program.
- ii. Differences regarding policy instruction exist among the academia in Pakistan
 - 1) It is important to have a consensus on the definition of Governance, Public Policy and Public Administration to provide direction to the various policy programs in the country
 - 2) There is a consensus on moving beyond Neo-classical economics and instead including Political Economy and Institutional Economics but it is not reflected in the curriculum.
 - 3) The policy program vision differs between academics, which prefer Generalists or Experts.
- iii. Reservations still exist regarding the market for policy graduates. Although there is a lot of room, it will be necessary to inform and educate prospective clients about the benefits of policy research including the legislation, commerce and professional associations.
- iv. English Language as the sole medium of instruction and academic production was identified as a contributing factor in limiting comprehension and articulation of students.
- v. Graduate degree is a confusing term as Master's level programs could require 14 or 16 years of education.
- vi. Policy programs in the country are dominated by Master's programs requiring 14 years of education: MPA programs (9), Governance (1), Public Policy (1); Master's/MPhil programs require 16 years of education: Public Administration (4), Public Policy (3); PhD (6); Executive Programs also require 16 years of education: Public Administration (1), Public Policy (1).
- vii. MPA programs are more in line with management than policy. They are highly influenced by the market demand for MBA and IT. Thus the domineering aspect of the MPA curriculum and faculty expertise is Human Resource Management (HRM). Concentrations usually offered in MPA programs are HRM, Marketing, Finance, MIS with few schools also offering Development. Additionally theoretical courses in Globalization, Political Economy or Politics of Policy Making are completely missing from most Public Administration curriculums.
- viii. Based on curriculum, policy schools in Pakistan can be categorized into three different types
 - 1) MPA program which are heavily influence by management rather than policy
 - 2) Policy programs, which are a slight modification of economics programs. They aim to produce policy professionals with an economic expertise.
 - 3) A diverse governance/policy program with the aim of producing a generalist.
- ix. Though the HEC has introduced a TTS system to improve faculty compensation, its requirements can not be met by existing faculty in most public sector universities and thus a dual system is expected to continue which does not auger well for the institutions.
- x. The Student Faculty Ratio varies though an average of 38 students for one full time faculty member is high for graduate level instruction. Some school's ratio is as high as 100.

- xi. Research culture does not exist in the universities because
 - 1) In the absence of Tenure Track System (TTS), compensation package is not enough to attract good faculty
 - 2) Faculty which is not part of TTS, teaches multiple courses other than the required number to supplement their income, leaving no time for research.
 - 3) Few universities have a culture adhering to Faculty Office Hours, Teaching Assistants to support the faculty and Research Assistants to both support faculty research as well as to promote a culture of research among the student body.
 - 4) Financial support for research is limited such that even faculty in research oriented institutions are taking on consultancies to supplement their income.
- xii. There is a dearth of faculty expertise in most areas of the public domain.
 - 1) Need is critical in Economic Theory and Quantitative & Empirical Analysis, both considered required subjects in the policy domain. Some PA programs don't even offer courses in these areas.
 - 2) Though a need exists in Financial Management, it is not critical.
 - 3) The Public Management area seems to have transformed into HRM where enough faculty expertise exists. But within Public Management, areas such as Organizational Analysis, Structure and Process of Government, and Leadership and Administrative Theory have been neglected.
 - 4) There is absolutely no faculty expertise in Political Economy, Globalization, Governance and Development, the most important aspects of Public Policy.
 - 5) Policy program also do not have expertise in peripheral but important areas of Ethics and Law.
 - 6) Among skills oriented areas such as MIS, Communication & Proposal Writing, the faculty situation is better.
- xiii. Few public universities have been supporting their junior faculty to complete a foreign PhD degree in addition to producing their own PhDs, but for most universities, a faculty development plan or institutional strategic plan does not exist.
- xiv. Historically linkages with foreign universities existed such as between IBA and Wharton School of Business, but these were not institutionalized and slowly tapered off due to the disregard of university administration.
- xv. Library resources are limited in the policy domain. There is a general lack of books and little university funding to buy new books. Additionally other than Public Sector universities, JSTOR , a electronic journal archive is not accessible.
- xvi. Similarly lab facilities are also needed especially analytical and statistical software which are both expensive and additionally have limited in house faculty expertise.

Recommendations

- i. GINI should use the Annual Conference Regional Seminars to develop a minimal consensus on instructional issues highlighted in this report including the role of economics especially Neo-classical Economics versus Political Economy & Institutional Economics, the suggested level of quantification in policy analysis, language use and the Expert vs Generalist option.
- ii. The policy programs across the country should form an association, which devises standards for the programs. HEC is fulfilling part of these responsibilities but has yet to develop a curriculum and faculty standards for policy programs. An association should suggest and ask schools to
- iii. Develop a 5 year strategic plan which includes both faculty and institutional capacity enhancement
- iv. Devise standards for faculty time to be spent on Teaching, Administration and Research. Change walk-in policy and institute Teaching & Research Assistantships to further research culture.

- v. Devise a transition plan of existing faculty from the current system to the TTS system.
- vi. The network/association should create linkages with foreign universities, formulate and institutionalize an exchange program of both faculty and students.
- vii. The network/association should create a pool of experts encompassing various domains of public policy.
- viii. For faculty capacity building, a three tiered plan needs to be developed

Short Term:

- i. All policy programs should develop linkages with social science departments of their university to use social science faculty expertise to train their students in areas they currently lack expertise in: Economic Analysis, Political Economy etc.
- ii. Devise incentives for faculty to deliver research seminars to promote a culture of research.
- iii. Using its pool of experts or foreign faculty, short term (weeks or months) courses should be devised during the semester (accessible to city wide faculty) or summer (accessible to all faculty) to improve overall faculty capacity. If physical presence is hard to manage, then at least a distant learning program can be devised to enhance the knowledge base of the faculty.

Medium Term:

- i. Institutionalize the curriculum and program structure for junior faculty in select subject areas to be delivered by the pool of experts. Develop collaboration among schools such that junior faculty from Public Administration program take an intensive course in economics with an Economics/Public Policy expert and vice versa.
- ii. Encourage exchange and collaboration between programs between different provincial public/private universities. Both an intra-provincial network as well as multiple inter-provincial networks can help learning opportunities for all participants.
- iii. Provide 3-4 month summer research sabbaticals in select subject areas in foreign universities where the faculty can work under the supervision of an expert in the field.
- iv. Facilitate Post-Docs and provide short term grants or scholarships to faculty with domestic PhDs to provide exposure to foreign academic and research culture.

Long Term:

- i. Institutionalize linkages and exchange programs with foreign universities such that a long term commitment is made by the foreign university to support a domestic program. The association can play a significant role in facilitating and managing the exchange program between the universities.
- ii. Provide PhD scholarships to faculty in select subject areas for which experts do not exist in Pakistan.
- iii. Build select PhD programs with resources including faculty, library and lab. Create incentive structures for all participating expert faculty to give part of their time to the PhD program so as to pool subject area expertise from across the country.
- iv. In terms of supporting an academic and research culture
- v. Policy research grants should be instituted for competitive bidding by institutions or faculty.
- vi. Linkages between domestic think tanks and university departments should be facilitated through collaborative research as well as internship programs for students.
- vii. A network newsletter comprising of policy issues should be distributed among students.
- viii. Institute a peer reviewed policy journal or support an existing journal
- ix. Establish merit scholarships to improve student body intake in policy programs and devise paper or thesis competition to encourage student research.

- x. In terms of institutional capacity, Library and Lab resources are a need across all policy programs.
- xi. Rather than investing in one library, all universities should be provided electronic access to select policy journals and JSTOR.
- xii. Specialized resources should be built up in every library such that a complete collection of the policy domain is available in the country. This can be done based on the program concentrations offered by different schools.
- xiii. For lab resources, a large initiative should be to build a centralized data centre, which hosts primary research data from all government and non-government institutions. On a smaller scale, it is important to equip labs in all schools with basic quantitative analysis software and a trained faculty member.

**BASELINE RESEARCH ON TRAINING NEEDS ASSESSMENT (TNA)
FOR 2 YEAR AND 4 YEAR BACHELORS LEVEL PROGRAMS
BY DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS, SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES &
INSTITUTE OF PUBLIC POLICY, BEACONHOUSE NATIONAL UNIVERSITY,
LAHORE**

FINDINGS

General

- i. Most of the universities are based in public sector in all regions except for Sind where a relatively larger number of universities are based in private sector. It is interesting to find that number of universities in Punjab and Sind is equal and Balochistan needs special attention to higher education.
- ii. Progressively rising number of public and private sector universities & degree awarding institutions and enrollment of students in these academic institutions is indicative of growing demand for education in Pakistan especially after late 90s. It is interesting to know that the proportion of female student enrollment though is low at all degree levels but is increasing overtime because of string growth. It is encouraging to know that in recognition to significance of university education in recent past, public and private sector both have responded positively.
- iii. Despite of the fact that growth of number of private sector universities has remained notable and encouraging, more than 75% of the enrollment at university level in all regions except for Sind is in public sector universities. This also hints at the fact that public sector as compared with private sector has relatively more capacity to accommodate the students at university level and there is need to expand the existing academic and non-academic infrastructure and capacity of private sector universities in Pakistan. Students enroll in public sector universities because of their subsidized fee structure. Another way to look at the picture of university level of education is possibly the number of students produced at various levels of degrees, by private and public sector universities and by region. Here, again, private sector universities are far behind as compared with the public sector universities in producing the number of students and interestingly the ratio of male to female students produced by public sector is far low i.e almost 1:1 as compared with that of private sector which is around 3:1. Number of students produced by area during 2001-04 is indicative of the fact that female student output as compared with that of male at university level education is alarmingly low except for Punjab. Lastly, bulk of females acquires university education up to bachelor level. Thereafter their number declines relatively more though it is encouraging to find that there is strong growth over time. Marriages, looking after their families and other cultural and social are principal reasons constraining female higher education. This calls our attention to the need for motivation and funding for female education at university level.

Assessment of Selected Universities in Pakistan

- i. Given the situation of governance and education in Pakistan, it is unfortunate that none of the universities/colleges selected in the sample offer a full fledged program in Governance and Public Policy and only 53% of the universities/colleges offer at least one or more public policy linked disciplines at bachelor level. At the same time, it is encouraging to know the special consideration for Economics and Political Science among governance and public policy linked disciplines because 80% of the universities/colleges offer Economics and 70 % offer Political Science at bachelor level.

- ii. Non-existence of governance and public policy linked disciplines in educational institutions indicates the missing focus on governance and public policy issues in the country. The survey gives rise to the question, **“Why public administration in special and governance and public policy linked disciplines in general have been neglected by academic institutions.”** The factors behind such neglect may be looked at both from demand side and supply side.
- iii. Poor infrastructure, shortage of trained faculty especially at senior level due to poor incentive system in public sector and financial constraints are apparently the possible factors hindering the supply of these disciplines. But demand side factors indicate a neglect of public policy disciplines on the part of government. Despite of having a long history of bad governance and public policy issues, Government of Pakistan meets its human resource requirements for governance and public policy through Federal Public Service Commission which holds competitive examination for selection in which candidates can participate with a bachelor degree without imposing any restriction on discipline. Government of Pakistan has failed to recognize and therefore has never floated demand for graduates with an expertise in public policy and governance. Therefore, the student body has always preferred to choose the disciplines with higher demand like business administration, engineering, medical etc. and academic institutions have accordingly responded to the situation.
- iv. Assessment of faculty in public policy linked disciplines in universities/colleges reveals interesting results. Public sector educational institutions are functioning with relatively more junior faculty (mostly lecturers and assistant professors even heads of department being assistant professors in certain cases). 80% of the total faculty consists of teaching assistants, lecturers and assistant professors, only 20% of the total faculty is foreign qualified and 29% of the total faculty holds PhD in public policy linked disciplines in the selected sample from public sector. On the other hand, even private sector institutions are also functioning with majority of junior faculty but here 67% of total faculty consists of lecturers and assistant professors but this proportion is far better as compared to the situation of public sector institutions. It is quite encouraging to recognize that 52% of the total faculty holds PhD and 63% is foreign qualified in selected disciplines of private sector educational institutions.
- v. Most of the senior faculty especially PhDs apparently seems to have moved to private sector. Private sector has been successful to attract senior faculty from public sector by offering attractive packages in terms of salaries, perquisites, stimulating working environment and flexibility in recent past since establishment of HEC followed by its policies for regulation of education sector. This has also affected the research contribution of public sector institutions. Private sector has also succeeded in attracting relatively more foreign qualified faculty even at junior level as compared with public sector. Therefore, this is challenge for public sector and government should try on urgent grounds to find ways of strengthening the public sector institutions because bulk of Pakistani students cannot afford to pay high costs for education.
- vi. Survey results show more than 55 % of the faculty time is allocated to teaching in both public sector and private sector institutions and time allocated to research is only 18.54% in public sector. These results indicate the scope and need for training and motivation of our faculty for research especially in public sector.
- vii. Based on survey results, we can conclude that private sector institutions have a practice to use a balanced combination of the listed teaching methods and though the methods are frequently used but faculty is not fully trained specially in use of case studies, research seminars/ workshops, interactive group discussions and problem solving as a teaching method. Assessment of teaching methods by students also reveals that private institutions use mix of teaching methods. This finding is closely consistent with the finding of teaching assessment methods by faculty of private sector.

- viii. Conventional lectures and problem solving method are the most common teaching methods used and there exists an ample scope for training in all teaching methods in public sector institutions. Assessment of teaching methods by students also indicates that except for conventional lecturers and problem solving method, other teaching methods are not very common in public sector institutions.
- ix. The most commonly used student assessment methods are conventional examination, research assignments/projects, quizzes, class participation, and individual presentations in private sector and there exists scope for training in three of the listed student assessment methods namely research assignments/projects, class participation and individual presentations. Student assessment of assessment methods also shows that mix of the evaluation methods is being practiced in private sector.
- x. Despite of the desperate situation of governance, none of the surveyed faculty members has ever attended a program at PhD level or Post Doctoral Level and the proportion of those who participated at Masters/M.Phil level or even of those who have attended a short training in governance is also desperate. 71% of the faculty of private sector is inclined to join at PhD level and around 43% at Masters/M.Phil level for fully funded training in Governance and Public Policy while the public sector faculty is motivated to join the training program at any level.
- xi. Faculty in both private and public sector has clear tilt towards joining the fully funded training program at some foreign institution. This finding in itself is also a strong indication for poor teaching capacity and inability to deliver required standard knowledge and training of Pakistani Universities. Only 2% is willing to join on self finance basis which also highlights the financial constraints of the faculty of Pakistani universities.
- xii. There exist two types of programs in terms of duration at bachelor level in public policy linked disciplines across the country i.e. two years bachelor and four years bachelor. Two years program at bachelor level is only offered by public sector institutions especially public sector colleges affiliated with public sector universities while it has completely phased out from private sector institutions. Two years program lacks thoroughness and is very limited in its scope in terms of curriculum and its contents along with poorly designed course structure and lack of specialization and without any mandatory requirement of internship, thesis or even a research project or assignments. Admissions in two year bachelors are only made based on past academic performance only and there is no requirement of aptitude test. Therefore, students coming with two years bachelor are not prepared at all for a Masters program in governance and public policy. While four years programs at bachelor level offer relatively broad based education including interdisciplinary courses, compulsory courses and discipline specific core courses along with mandatory requirement of internship, a research project or assignments or even a thesis. Admissions in four years bachelor are mostly based on aptitude test, interviews and past academic performance.
- xiii. All universities from private sector selected in the sample offer only four years program at bachelor level. But there are also some universities from public sector which have also started four years program at bachelor level in public policy linked disciplines. There are also some universities which are currently offering no program at all bachelor level on their campuses like Quid-e-Azam University, Islamabad and University of the Punjab, Lahore.
- xiv. Unfortunately, there is not even a single university either from private or public sector from the selected sample which has included governance or public policy or a mix of these two areas in its curriculum as a full fledged academic programs at bachelor level.
- xv. Results based on perceived response from faculty and students both from private and public sector show existing gap between the degree of relevance of a learning outcome or a skill and extent of its delivery with a few exceptions which basically identifies skills gap and areas of weakness and strength of students and scope for faculty training to

narrow this gap down. It is interesting to find that skill gap identified by faculty and students of respective sectors for top ten skills in descending order is relatively high in public sector universities as compared with that of private sector.

- xvi. Based on survey results it can be concluded that both the students and faculty of public sector apparently seems dissatisfied with infrastructure available in academic institutions but the position of infrastructure in private sector seems to be relatively better. Results of the survey regarding infrastructure assessment by faculty and students of private sector indicate that private sector and public sectors need significant improvement in the areas of infrastructure.

CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATION

- i. In view of mounting public policy, the governance situation in the country and alarmingly low access to university education in, there exists an ample scope of training for students as well as faculty in the discipline of governance and public policy in Pakistan.
- ii. Poor infrastructure, shortage of trained faculty especially at senior level due to poor incentive system in public sector and financial constraints are apparently the possible factors hindering the supply of these disciplines. But demand side factors indicate a neglect of public policy disciplines on the part of government. Despite of having a long history of bad governance and public policy issues, Government of Pakistan meets its human resource requirements for governance and public policy through Federal Public Service Commission which holds competitive examination for selection in which candidates can participate with a bachelor degree without imposing any restriction on discipline. Government of Pakistan has failed to recognize and therefore has never floated demand for graduates with an expertise in public policy and governance. Therefore, the student body has always preferred to choose the disciplines with higher demand like business administration, engineering, medical etc. and academic institutions have accordingly responded to the situation.
- iii. But success of the program of governance and public policy at masters level rests with a special focus on inducement from demand side apart from supply side measures. In current scenario, there is a need for graduates with competence and expertise in governance and public policy in public sector. However, this realization needs to be instigated in the public sector. The conventional hiring process in public sector for selection and induction of civil savants through competitive examination or direct placements through political influence is flawed and we need to devise and introduce new hiring process based on knowledge, skills, competence and expertise in governance and public policy acquired through well structured curriculum and training. Students with two year bachelor degree apparently seem not prepared for training in governing and public policy at masters' level. Since the people join public service after completing their bachelors therefore we as a research team strongly recommend that bachelor level is the most appropriate entry point for governance and public policy courses to create a desired social impact on governance situation. A curriculum of introductory and intermediate level should be introduced as minor or elective courses in four years bachelor degree and students should be trained for governance and public policy issues through well structured advanced curriculum and training at masters level. The candidates for public service with knowledge and expertise of governance should be given an extra benefit in the selection process of public servants.
- iv. Based on identified strengths of faculty from survey results namely relatively more senior faculty, number of PhDs, and foreign qualified at senior and even at junior level in private sector academic institutions, we can conclude and comfortably recommend that private sector is suitable for launching the master level program in governance and public policy. On the other hand, public sector strongly needs to enrich its faculty through carefully planned training on governance and public policy issues before it takes

initiative to start such a program. Most of the faculty has clear and significant predisposition towards fully funded training at Ph.D level as first priority and then at Master/M.Phil level in governance and public policy preferably from some foreign academic institutions. Later part of this finding in itself is also a strong indication for poor teaching capacity and incapability to deliver required standard knowledge and training of Pakistani Universities. Faculty also needs training in modern teaching and student assessment methods

**BASELINE RESEARCH ON TRAINING NEEDS ASSESSMENT (TNA) FOR
INSTITUTING GOVERNANCE AS ELECTIVE SUBJECT / COURSE
IN PUBLIC COLLEGES
BY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION, UNIVERSITY OF KARACHI**

Key Findings

- i. As for the assessment of the college is concerned, the structural requirements of colleges are available to a larger extent. A limited number of Public colleges in Balochistan and interior Sindh have problem of building, furniture and teachers. Situation in the private colleges is much better which are more effective and organized. Private colleges have sufficient buildings and furniture but there is insufficient and less qualified teaching faculty.
- ii. In majority of colleges there is no proper arrangement of libraries. Most of these libraries were established much earlier and no update had taken place for years.
- iii. There are a large number of public colleges where medium of instruction is only Urdu or Urdu and English both. Therefore we need sufficient books and course material in both the languages. The majority of private colleges have English as medium of instruction.
- iv. In level of programs, there are colleges with single program like only intermediate or only bachelor with a single academic program like only Arts or only science or commerce. In colleges that have only science or only commerce have problem for availability of a social science faculty.
- v. Teaching faculty is available is sufficient in public colleges but are irrelevant in the sense that the required faculty is not available.
- vi. The number of teaching faculty who has a degree in Pakistan Studies not sufficiently available in colleges. Although, Pakistan Studies is taught in every college and in every program. The teaching faculty engaged for teaching of Pakistan Studies does not have a relevant degree in the field.
- vii. Only 6% of teachers engaged in teaching Pakistan studies have education equal to M. Phil or higher. 94% are only master degree holder with miscellaneous degrees.
- viii. The faculty teaching Pakistan Studies are mainly from political science and economic. However, there are some other relevant courses as well. In few cases Pakistan Studies is thought by teachers from irrelevant disciplines such as faculty with degrees in Urdu, Islamic Studies, English and other irrelevant degrees teaching Pakistan Studies, not only at the intermediate level but at Bachelor level as well.
- ix. As far as social science disciplines are concerned they have sufficient teaching faculty to teach Pakistan Studies. It means that governance related courses can easily be introduced in colleges with Arts / social sciences degree programs.
- x. The colleges with science disciplines have greater irrelevant faculty for teaching Pakistan Studies then social sciences and commerce.
- xi. As far as commerce disciplines are concerned they have sufficient teaching faculty for teaching of Pakistan studies, situation in commerce colleges is much better to science colleges.
- xii. No significant information about any specialized training or expertise was found, except B. E d. (Bachelor of Education) and M. Ed. (Master of Education).
- xiii. The teaching faculty in relevant disciplines is available sufficiently. However, the number of teaching faculty having degree in public policy is zero and very low in public administration that is only 15. However, a large number of faculty is available in commerce colleges with degrees in MBA and M. Com.
- xiv. It is observed that college education well organized in Gilgit Baltistan region, Islamabad and Kashmir. Among the four provinces NWFP is most organized college education in

Pakistan, following Punjab, Sindh and Balochistan at the lowest level. Among the Urban centers Karachi has the poorest college system in public sector in Pakistan.

Recommendations

- i. There is a need for infra-structure improvement in public Colleges, particularly in interior Sindh and Balochistan. There is specific requirement in building, faculty, electricity and furniture.
- ii. There is a need for libraries and academic books / literatures. This needs to be addressed at the earliest.
- iii. Books and course material be developed and provided in both the languages 'Urdu and English'.
- iv. If course/s related to Governance has to be introduced at college level then the colleges with only sciences disciplines be given serious thought. Because the colleges with social sciences and commerce may be able to overcome with the teaching faculty availably of other relevant teaching faculty.
- v. There is a need for reorganization / restructuring of the teaching faculty in the context of human resource management. Like the right person with right qualification and expertise at the right place, as currently there is no proper management.
- vi. The course on Pakistan Studies may be taught by teaching faculty with relevant expertise and qualification in the subject area. Like Master Degree in Pakistan Studies will be the best option and the second options could be Master degree in Political Science. In this regard it may be determined that what other fields of studies are nearest / relevant to Pakistan studies.
- vii. Opportunity should be provided for degree enhancement in all fields of studies. However, faculty situation at college level particularly in social science is needs urgent improvement. In the context preference should be given to governance, Pakistan studies, political science, public administration, public policy and others deemed to be relevant fields.
- viii. If Governance related courses are to be introduced at intermediate level, serious consideration is required for Science and commerce colleges.
- ix. Training of teaching faculty at colleges is must before Governance course is to be introduced. Training can be divided into two phases; Short term and long term training. Provincial stakeholders can be involved for this purpose.
- x. Governance related subjects may be introduced at the Bachelor level in the colleges. However, selected contents of governance subject may be incorporated in civics and Pakistan Studies at the intermediate levels. In this regard we have to have prescribed and developed curricula of governance subject. Recommendations of curricula committee can further substantiate this recommendation.

**BASELINE RESEARCH ON USER NEEDS PROFILE OF
EXECUTIVE EDUCATION IN GOVERNANCE
BY INNOVATIVE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES (IDS), ISLAMABAD**

Key Findings

- i. The overarching importance of good governance is now being increasingly recognized. Kofi Annan the former UN Secretary General was only echoing the conventional wisdom when he remarked “Good governance is perhaps the single most important factor in eradicating poverty and promoting development.” The essence of the governance in public realm lies in the exercise of economic, political, and administrative authority to manage national or sub-national affairs. The exercise of authority to promote good governance must take place within a framework of laws and societal discipline, characterized, among other things, by participation of people, rule of law, probity in public services, transparency, equity and inclusiveness and accountability.
- ii. The governance indicators of Pakistan are not enviable. Striving for good governance in our case calls for incessant endeavors; both short term and long term, across a wide spectrum. For achieving this critical goal Pakistan must make serious efforts for espousing single minded commitment to good governance, transform societal norms, laws, attitudes and institutions. In this process executive education of public functionaries and other societal actors can play a very significant role
- iii. Public functionaries’ attitudes, knowledge and skills in particular can prove to be extremely an important in providing good governance. In this context properly structured and focused training programs are critical. In order to design such programs it is essential to undertake research to determine a User Needs profile of executive education/in-service training on governance in Pakistan. Without ascertaining the needs of stakeholders one will be only groping in dark.
- iv. Building capabilities for good governance is essentially a supply side task. Executive education falls within this category as it seeks to provision equipping suppliers’ i.e. government functionaries and public representatives with better knowledge, skills and attitudes. Good governance however cannot be fully achieved without the active participation of demand side actors, including civil society and the general public. An active and knowledgeable citizenry conscious of their rights and aware of ways in which these rights can be demanded is really necessary for ensuring that good governance forms an integral part of the organizational culture and operational structure of the state and its agencies.
- v. In this report an attempt has been made to highlight the role of users of executive education and its scope also encompasses the empowerment of civil society and people at large to demand good governance as well as to become partners of the government in providing good governance.
- vi. The need for reflecting demand side inputs and improving supply side response is a stupendous task .This report is a first step on a long journey. Follow up in terms of further knowledge searching for new insights and implementation of recommendation made needs to be attended to with continuing seriousness in days to come.

Summary of Recommendations

Recommendations made in this report fall in the following categories Vital, Very Important, Important and Desirable/Optional. Hence recommendations have been arranged in this order. At the end of summary of recommendations, a synoptic view of recommendations indication as to agencies who are to take action and time line of recommendations.

A. Vital Recommendations:

- i. The number of training institutes should be increased in order to cater to requirements of the training of specialized and ex-cadre personnel. Chapter V, Number of Training).
- ii. Training institutions, as well as demand side users of executive education programs including government agencies, should follow the principles of Change Management aiming to *transform* and not merely focusing in incremental change.
- iii. Executive education programs should fully address the need to break away from elitist traditions and attitudes.
- iv. Appropriate policies and incentives driving behaviour should be adopted. A full fledged in-depth study should be conducted to ascertain the best way of achieving this critically important objective.
- v. A dedicated module on Governance should be prescribed. (See box 4 for the possible subjects that may be included.
- vi. The government should start conveying its training needs in detail to the executive education institutions. The Board of Governors of these Institutions, as a standard operating procedure, should assess if the needful is being done.
- vii. Capacity Building of civil society organizations should be undertaken, keeping in view their two roles: demanders of good governance and partners to the government in promoting good governance. Civil Society Organizations, media, NGOs etc should be encouraged to play their role in improving governance. They should be trained in courses and areas deemed critical to governance as suggested in the report.
- viii. Likewise capacity building of media, business community, and other professional groups should be undertaken for demanding better governance and acting as partners in the management of public affairs.

B. Very Important Recommendations:

- i. The existing ethics management system in Pakistan's bureaucracy may be made more effective to yield high integrity outcomes.
- ii. There should be a code of ethics prohibiting MNA/MPAs from interference in executive functions.
- iii. Forums should be established at which senior officials be required to report publicly on the performance of their institutions.
- iv. Strengthening and capacity building of the training institutions be given greater importance.
- v. The efficacy of courses of NMC and SMC be periodically determined through a proper evaluation conducted through an impartial external agency.
- vi. Both the Simulation Exercises of the Mid Career Management Course and at least one each of the SMC and NMC should focus its research on a critical area of public service delivery so enabling their participants to understand, the basic issues involved in governance.
- vii. In order to pay due attention, inter alia, to the training of specialized services/ex-cadre officers, a policy making institutional mechanism be set up in the form of a separate Division in the Federal Secretariat which may also be made responsible for ensuring that user need profiles of functionaries belonging to cadres (including ex-cadre officers) not yet covered by the Establishment Division are prepared.
- viii. Provincial governments should be encouraged to streamline their systems of training and expand the functional scope of their training institutions to encompass specialized cadres/ex-cadre functionaries.
- ix. Supply side actors should become cognizant of the roles and functions of each user type in imparting training to various stakeholders.

- x. Any executive education program developed for public representatives should seek among other things, attitudinal changes conducive to pass on some attitudes for better prospects of good governance awareness of their being trustees, bound to discharge their duties with honesty and competence, willingness to take up issues related to corruption, mismanagement and human rights violations.
- xi. The Board of Governors should regularly assess if the training programmes are delivering.
- xii. A world class core faculty should be recruited and efforts should be made to retain it in training institutions.
- xiii. Specialized groups training needs should be catered to.
- xiv. Courses for local governance executive education may include among others Local Governance Ordinance 2001, Conflict Management, Community Organizations, role of public representative, Political and Social activism, Financial Budgeting and planning etc.

C. Important Recommendations:

- i. Civil servants should be exposed to the maximum amount of interaction with citizens in course of their training programs
- ii. Knowledge may be imparted to the legislators of subjects, such as; concept of governance, process of budget making and preparation of Annual Development Programme, standards of accountability and transparency etc.
- iii. Skills like the management of allocated funds, methods and techniques of taking legislative initiatives, methods of sharing information with stakeholders, techniques of establishing network with academia and intelligentsia may be imparted to them.
- iv. New subjects may be added to the current curricula as desired by various stakeholders due to their importance under the new paradigm of devolved governance.
- v. One day retreat of secretaries may be held to deliberate upon various policy issues including governance specifically.
- vi. The provincial Governments may be encouraged to take similar action.
- vii. All the universities/institutions imparting professional education may include the subject of governance in their curricula.
- viii. A proper system of i) job descriptions and ii) institutional performance evaluation criterion may be prescribed ,so as to make possible comparison of performance against these bench marks.

D. Desirable Recommendations:

- i. The nexus between education in Public Administration and job prospects in the Central Superior Services (CSS) and Provincial Superior Services may be strengthened. This can be achieved by improving the prospects of gaining marks in these examinations by revising the level of questions downward and/or the standard of marking
- ii. The level of awareness of participants to be enhanced through Operations Research.
- iii. The parliament may get the appropriate courses designed by experts and may like to associate NSPP in this process pending that, a begining may be made by holding 5-7 day workshops. The Provincial Assemblies may like to take similar action.
- iv. Training institutions may keep in view recommendations regarding inclusion of subjects made in focus groups discussions.
- v. Current load of course work needs to be rationalized and made more manageable.

- vi. Certain core training domains identified in a survey of government functionaries and public representatives at district level in NWFP may be considered for adoption by other provincial governments.
- vii. Training and awareness workshop for civil society organizations to be organized by the NGOs and supported by the government through funding and resource persons (NGOs can also play a major role in mobilization of financial and human resource).
- viii. Training for business community be organized by the Chambers of Commerce.
- ix. Training for media, doctors, engineers, lawyers may be organized by their professional organizations with the assistance and collaboration of government agencies. (Duration five to seven days).

**BASELINE RESEARCH ON CURRENT STATE OF
EXECUTIVE EDUCATION COURSES/PROGRAMS IN PAKISTAN
BY DR. PERVEZ TAHIR**

Key Findings

- i. Training institutions tend to confuse management with governance. Governance is supposed to be taught through an educational recipe, which is too much information and very little hands-on experience.
- ii. The system produces more knowing than doing executives. Service delivery is not helped in this train of thought. The trainee-trainer relationship that exists fails to produce the desired outcome.
- iii. Production of public values, behavioural change and the consciousness that citizens have rights to be respected are missing. There is an emphasis on hierarchical control than observance of transparent rules of the game.
- iv. The baseline of executive education in Pakistan calls for continuing reform.

In case of NSPP, however, these historically persisting inadequacies and shortcomings are being addressed, though the replication of the isolated distinction that this institution has achieved is hardly discernable anywhere else.

Recommendations

- i. Education and training should be separated. Education should be formal and in world class universities given at appropriate stage. Training should be related to the effective ways of governing service delivery.
- ii. Training should follow a post-training posting plan. This will ensure a correspondence between training and future job description.
- iii. Training must not ignore the obvious. An understanding of rules of business and procedures is taken for granted. These elements should be essential part of the training.
- iv. Research methods, computer applications and courses doing the same under different names, do not serve the purpose they are intended for. These skills are irrelevant for the senior officers. At junior levels, these skills should relate to the departmental case studies.
- v. Consideration should be given to expose public as well as private sector to the same training programmes. This mix will catalyze a better understanding of public value to the private sector and efficiency and productivity to the public sector.
- vi. Legislators too need training. Consideration should be given to set up a separate parliamentary training institute.
- vii. Media has now enough resources to set up its own training institute. Organizations of proprietors, editors, and working journalists should be encouraged to pool their efforts in this direction.
- viii. Post-training impact should be monitored and evaluated in terms of measurable indicators. This will provide the presently missing feedback for future improvements.