

CONCLUDING STATEMENT

In the back drop of deepening governance crisis in Pakistan arising out of growing mistrust between the governing and the governed, the Governance Education Network (GEN) first International Annual Conference on ***Governance, Sustainable Growth, Peace & Equity*** was held from 13-15 December, 2009 at Islamabad. The conference was an important component of the Governance Institutes Network International (GINI) initiative on promoting governance education in Pakistan with the financial assistance of Government of Norway which aims at creating a national integrated network to advance governance knowledge with the objective of creating capacity in various spheres of governance covering universities, colleges, institutions, practitioners, researchers, NGOs, think tanks, media and the student body of Pakistan. Since start of the program in November, 2008, the Governance Education Network (GEN) membership has grown to 21 members' institutions including some of the prestigious public and private universities/colleges in Pakistan and Norwegian Institutions which are actively collaborating in achieving the goals/objectives of the program

The governance education program is structured on five components of *governance curriculum, training needs assessment, executive education, research and annual conference*. The Program Steering Committee and a sub-committee for each of these components comprising members of the network have been constituted for smooth implementation of various program components.

The GEN Conference-2009 was attended by over 200 national and international delegates including political leaders, members of Parliament and Provincial Assemblies, senior officials of Federal and Provincial Governments, experts from Canada USA and Norway, academicians, diplomats, members of research organizations, donors community, media and civil society. Mr. Owais Ahmed Ghani, Governor NWFP, Mr. Hamayun Saifullah Khan, MNA & Member, Parliamentary Committee on Constitutional Reforms, Dr. Abdul Malik Baloch, Chairperson, Senate Functional Committee on Problems of Less Developed Areas and Mr. Kiramat Ullah Khan, Speaker Provincial Assembly, NWFP chaired various sessions of the conference.

The focus of the Conference was on core areas of governance and to explore linkages among governance, sustainable growth, peace and equity by focusing on such themes: federalism; decentralization and local governance; gender equity and governance; poverty alleviation and governance; peaceful and sustainable governance strategies to counter terrorism. It afforded mutually learning opportunity by capitalizing on the stakeholders' knowledge to harness Research for Development and fostered a cross contextual exchange of ideas, policy choices and institutional determinants to enhance effectiveness of governance. Additional focus of the conference was to debate the outcomes of seven baseline research studies related to governance programs, training needs assessment (TNA), executive education and governance indicators in Pakistan conducted under GINI initiative for promoting governance education, in the wider forum of all stakeholders. The stakeholders' consultation helped in assessing the demand for Governance programs (masters, bachelors and public colleges), executive education and faculty capacity building programs/courses and to finalize a policy framework for development of these programs/courses.

The experts' presentations during six sessions on the conference themes followed by open discussion through Q&A highlighted that poor governance restrains and distorts the process of development and has a disproportionate impact on the poor and weaker segments of the society which clearly shows that good governance and sustainable development are intertwined. Therefore, any policy discourse on improving peace and security implies improving governance. Some critical questions debated during the conference included: how governance processes and institutions work in democratic and authoritarian systems; the role played by parliamentary democracies in promoting social, political harmony & peace; how issues of provincial & local governance are being shaped and influenced in Pakistan and what can be learnt from the Norwegian and international experience to improve governance.

The consensus recommendations emerging out of the three days deliberations of the conference aimed at promoting good governance, sustainable growth, peace & equity were as follows:

Federalism: Theory, Practice and Challenges:

- i. Federalism offers itself as the best solution to diverse cultures and plural society like Pakistan
- ii. Comprehensive approach to federalism be adopted to promote political, administrative and fiscal reforms in the light of best international federal practices.
- iii. The resources, representation and rights of Balochistan province must be protected under the federal framework of Pakistan.
- iv. The recently announced NFC Award and Balochistan Package are steps in the right direction to promote federalism and strengthening representative form of democracy.

Democracy and Security: Learning from the International Experiences:

- i. The controversies largely woven around democracy, societal security and religious extremism demand a new paradigm to ensure socio-cultural understanding which involves dialogical reasoning to build the bridge along with paradigm of religious understanding in order to encourage rational development of democracy and civil society institutions.
- ii. There was consensus among participants to search for ways to change the authoritarian mindset of rulers.
- iii. The new security challenges have cross border linkages and demand radically different approach in addressing the issues of human well being and enhancing the capacity of institutions of governance

Gender Equity & Governance:

- i. Human capital view of gender equity be promoted and gender issues at societal and personal level be addressed.

- ii. Gender equity is critical for improving governance and be addressed remaining within our own culture and institutional context.

Decentralization and Local Governance:

- i. There is a need to strengthen and democratize internal functioning of the political parties in order to promote and deepen the culture of dialogue on specific national issues.
- ii. The decentralization including strengthening of democracy at local level and greater provincial autonomy are steps towards right direction.
- iii. One of the key concerns that corrupt democracy must be corrected by building consensus through media and civil society's social movements.

Sustainable Governance Strategies to Counter Terrorism:

- i. There was a broad consensus to counter terrorism through a state-society partnership.
- ii. There is a growing sense of relief and realization that military operations against militants have been very successful because of strong public support and growing anti terrorism public sentiment in the country.
- iii. Political stability in Afghanistan and the fight against terrorism was considered critical to the success of Pakistan's on-going efforts to fight armed insurgency in FATA and the adjoining areas.
- iv. By improving governance and by investing in education and development sector, Pakistan stands very good chance of overcoming the challenge of extremism and terrorism.
- v. Corruption has both direct and indirect impacts on terrorist activities. For effective counter-terrorism strategies, anti-corruption practices and measures need to be adopted.

Poverty Alleviation and Governance

- i. Priority need to be given to small farmers ensuring a greater inclusiveness of the poor in growth.
- ii. Critical role of corporate agricultural farming, corporate ventures and community activism, Grameen Model as a benchmark may be considered.

Outcome of Governance Education Baseline Research:

- The national and international participants applauded the GINI initiative to promote governance education in Pakistan and the baseline research conducted on various programs of Governance Education was acknowledged as an important contribution providing initial input for executing any governance related program. The participants strongly recommended further evaluation especially in the area of executive education and the initiation of governance education at the Undergraduate Level as well.
- Main recommendations of the baseline research studies presented during the conference are at **Annex**.

OUTCOME OF GOVERNANCE EDUCATION BASELINE RESEARCH

Baseline Research on Governance Programs and Disciplines offered in Pakistan by Institute of Public Administration (IAS), University of the Punjab, Lahore

- i. Pakistan's experience of running Public Administration and Public Policy programs clearly suggests that new dedicated governance programs with nomenclature such as BS(Hons)/MS in Governance may not be viable at present. Instead, there is a need for strengthening existing programs in Public Administration, Public Management, and Public Policy through development of Governance curriculum, development of indigenous reading material, and capacity building of faculty.
- ii. Post-graduate Diploma and certificate in Governance may be a viable option for launching dedicated program in Governance Studies. The Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab, has shown willingness to start such courses subject to the availability funds for initial years.
- iii. Multidisciplinary approach is recommended for curriculum development with courses in the area of regulatory governance, service delivery, institutional and public management reform, public policy analysis, development governance and management, collaborative governance mechanisms. There is a need to develop courses with special focus on policy and management issues in various sectors of Pakistan's economy.
- iv. Networking between institutions both on supply and demand side is strongly recommended for sustainability of Governance programs. Both GINI and GEN were long awaited initiatives that need to be strengthened.

Baseline Research on TNA for Masters' Level Programs by Centre for Public Policy & Governance (CPPG), F.C. College (A Chartered University), Lahore

- i. Develop Minimal Consensus on Policy Instruction.
- ii. Need for an Association to help Universities
 - 1) Set Curriculum & Faculty Time (Teaching, Research & Admin) Standards
 - 2) Devise Transition Plan for existing faculty to TTS
 - 3) Devise 5 year Strategic Plan for faculty development and institutional capacity building
 - 4) Linkages with foreign universities.

- iii. Develop 3 tiered plan for Faculty Development:
 - 1) Short Term:
 - a) Intra-university linkages between departments & Intra-city
 - b) Incentivize research through faculty seminars
 - c) Develop Short Term Course thru Pool of Experts
 - 2) Medium Term:
 - a) Institutionalize program for junior faculty
 - b) Develop intra-provincial, public-private collaboration
 - c) Short Term Sabbatical & Post Docs in foreign universities
 - 3) Long Term:
 - a) Build Domestic Centres of Excellence & PhD programs
 - b) Institutionalize linkages & exchange with foreign universities
 - c) PhD scholarships & research sabbaticals.

- iv. Develop/Facilitate Research Culture:
 - 1) University & Think Tanks linkages for Collaborative Research & Student Internships
 - 2) Research Grants
 - 3) Institute or Support a Peer Reviewed Policy Journal
 - 4) Collective Policy Newsletter
 - 5) Develop Specialized Library Resources
 - 6) Develop Primary Research Data Centre

Baseline Research related to TNA for 2 Year & 4 Year Bachelors Level Programs by Department of Economics, School of Social Sciences, and Institute of Public Policy, Beaconhouse National University, Lahore

- i. In view of mounting public policy issues, the governance situation in the country and alarmingly low access to university education, there exists an ample scope of training for students as well as faculty in the discipline of governance and public policy in Pakistan.
- ii. In current scenario, there is a strong need for graduates with competence and expertise in governance and public policy in public sector.
- iii. we need to devise and introduce new hiring process based on knowledge, skills, competence and expertise in governance and public policy. Students with two year bachelor degree apparently seem not prepared for training in governance and public policy at masters' level.
- iv. Since the people join public service after completing their bachelors therefore we as a research team strongly recommend that bachelor level is the most appropriate entry point for governance and public policy courses to create a desired social impact on governance situation.
- v. The candidates for public service with knowledge and expertise of governance should be given an extra benefit in the selection process of public servants.
- vi. A curriculum of introductory and intermediate level should be introduced as minor or elective courses in four years bachelor degree and students should be

trained for governance and public policy issues through well structured advanced curriculum and training at masters' level.

- vii. Based on identified strengths of faculty from survey results we can conclude and comfortably recommend that private sector is more suitable for launching the master level program in governance and public policy.
- viii. On the other hand, public sector strongly needs to enrich its faculty through carefully planned training on governance and public policy issues before it takes initiative to start such a program.
- ix. Most of the faculty has clear and significant predisposition towards fully funded training at Ph.D level as first priority and then at Master/M.Phil level in governance and public policy preferably from some foreign academic institutions.
- x. Faculty also needs training in research, modern teaching and student assessment methods.

Baseline Research for Instituting Governance as Elective Subject / Course in Public Colleges in Pakistan

By Department of Public Administration, University of Karachi, Karachi

- i. There is a need for infra-structure improvement in public Colleges, particularly in interior Sindh and Balochistan. There is specific requirement in building, faculty, electricity and furniture.
- ii. There is a need for libraries and academic books / literatures. This needs to be addressed at the earliest.
- iii. Books and course material be developed and provided in both the languages 'Urdu and English'.
- iv. If course/s related to Governance has to be introduced at college level then the colleges with only sciences disciplines be given serious thought. Because the colleges with social sciences and commerce may be able to overcome with the teaching faculty available of other relevant teaching faculty.
- v. There is a need for reorganization / restructuring of the teaching faculty in the context of human resource management. Like the right person with right qualification and expertise at the right place, as currently there is no proper management.
- vi. The course on Pakistan Studies may be taught by teaching faculty with relevant expertise and qualification in the subject area. Like Master Degree in Pakistan Studies will be the best option and the second options could be Master degree in Political Science. In this regard it may be determined that what other fields of studies are nearest / relevant to Pakistan studies.

- vii. Opportunity should be provided for degree enhancement in all fields of studies. However, faculty situation at college level particularly in social science is needs urgent improvement. In the context preference should be given to governance, Pakistan studies, political science, public administration, public policy and others deemed to be relevant fields.
- viii. If Governance related courses are to be introduced at intermediate level, serious consideration is required for Science and commerce colleges.
- ix. Training of teaching faculty at colleges is must before Governance course is to be introduced. Training can be divided into two phases; Short term and long term training. Provincial stakeholders can be involved for this purpose.
- x. Governance related subjects may be introduced at the Bachelor level in the colleges. However, selected contents of governance subject may be incorporated in civics and Pakistan Studies at the intermediate levels. In this regard we have to have prescribed and developed curricula of governance subject. Recommendations of curricula committee can further substantiate this recommendation.

Baseline Research on Current State of Executive Education Courses and Programs in Pakistan
by Dr. Pervez Tahir and the Team

- i. Education and training should be separated. Education should be formal and in world class universities given at appropriate stage. Training should be related to the effective ways of governing service delivery.
- ii. Training should follow a post-training posting plan. This will ensure a correspondence between training and future job description.
- iii. Training must not ignore the obvious. An understanding of rules of business and procedures is taken for granted. These elements should be essential part of the training.
- iv. Research methods, computer applications and courses doing the same under different names, do not serve the purpose they are intended for. These skills are irrelevant for the senior officers. At junior levels, these skills should relate to the departmental case studies.
- v. Consideration should be given to expose public as well as private sector to the same training programmes. This mix will catalyze a better understanding of public value to the private sector and efficiency and productivity to the public sector.
- vi. Legislators too need training. Consideration should be given to set up a separate parliamentary training institute.
- vii. Media has now enough resources to set up its own training institute. Organizations of proprietors, editors, and working journalists should be encouraged to pool their efforts in this direction.

- viii. Post-training impact should be monitored and evaluated in terms of measurable indicators. This will provide the presently missing feedback for future improvements.
- ix. The baseline of executive education in Pakistan calls for continuing reform. In case of NSPP, however, the historically persisting inadequacies and shortcomings are being addressed, though the replication of the isolated distinction that this institution has achieved is hardly discernable anywhere else.

Baseline Research on User Needs Profile of Executive Education in Governance by Innovative Development Strategies (IDS), Islamabad

- i. Number of training institutes should be increased.
- ii. Government should invariably convey its training needs to the executive education institutions.
- iii. A dedicated module on Governance should be prescribed.
- iv. Executive education programs should fully address the need to break away from elitist traditions / attitudes.
- v. Separate Division in the Federal Secretariat for training / executive education may be set up.
- vi. Strengthening and capacity building of the training institutions be given greater importance.
- vii. Capacity building of legislatures, civil society organizations, of media, business community, etc. should be undertaken to enable them to play a pro-active role in promoting good governance.
- viii. Process of capacity building of local governments' elected and appointed officials for good governance may be improved.
- ix. Ensuring the User Needs are Met Effectively Requires
 - 1) Individual Training/education programs of varying duration for different user needs (specified in the Report).
 - 2) Careful monitoring and refinement for replication and up scaling.
 - 3) Basic institutional change and fundamental overhaul of the overall attitudes prevalent in society
- x. The dedicated module on governance training should at a minimum cover:
 - 1) Concept of Governance
 - 2) Major Constraints to Good Governance in Pakistan
 - 3) Ethics in Public Service/Attitudinal and behavioral change
 - 4) Building Governance Capabilities
 - 5) Character Building
 - 6) Combating Corruption

- 7) Accountability Mechanisms including Administrative Arrangements, Ombudsmen and Courts.
- 8) Rule of Law
- 9) Fundamental Rights
- 10) Administrative Law and Law of Torts
- 11) Transparency / Dissemination of Information
- 12) Monitoring and Evaluation
- 13) Principles of Supervision
- 14) Participatory Development
- 15) Innovations in Service Delivery / Response based Performance Incentives and Participatory Action Planning
- 16) E-Governance
- 17) Case Studies on Governance
- 18) Practical Exposure to Interface meetings with Citizens and Public Complaint Handling e.g. Open Kutcheris

Baseline Research on Pakistan Specific Governance Indicators:

- i. **Economic Management**
 - 1) Size of the Government
 - 2) State Owned Enterprises
 - 3) Unemployment
 - 4) Investment

- ii. **Social Sector Expenditures**
 - 1) Government Expenditures
 - 2) Expenditures on social security
 - 3) Education
 - 4) Priorities in Education Budget
 - 5) Pupil - Teacher Ratio
 - 6) Health
 - 7) Household Income

- iii. **Budget Analysis**
 - 1) Current Government Finances
 - 2) Overall Budget Deficit/Surplus
 - 3) Taxes
 - 4) Budget Priorities

- iv. **Transparency and Information**
 - 1) Media and Communication
 - 2) International Telecommunication
 - 3) State Control of Media
 - 4) Freedom of Expression and Mobility
 - 5) Census

- v. **The Parliament**
 - 1) Number of bills passed by Parliament in last 5 years
 - 2) Number of ordinance passed in last 5 years
 - 3) Number of seats in the parliament

- 4) Elections
- 5) Date of last Election
- 6) Voter Turnout
- 7) Parties represented

vi. **Judiciary, Law and Human Rights**

- 1) Judiciary
- 2) Number of Cases
- 3) Average Salaries of Judges
- 4) People Arrested
- 5) Capital Punishment